

How Timid or Bold Are Ministries of Health and Provincial Health Authorities in Canada in Planning for Healthcare Quality?

Dans quelle mesure les ministères canadiens de la Santé et les autorités sanitaires provinciales sont-ils timides ou audacieux dans la planification de la qualité des soins de santé?

BENJAMIN T.B. CHAN, SUSMITHA RALLABANDI AND DAN FLORIZONE

Appendix 1.

TABLE A1. Rubric for scoring system-level health plans

Items to be scored	Conditions for achieving a full score	References
1. Existence of indicators	For each priority area, there should be a clearly defined indicator to measure progress.	Item 8 in the WHO Handbook for National Quality Policy and Strategy (hereafter referred to as NQPS) calls for “quality indicators & core measures” (WHO 2018: 8). The SMART framework calls for goals that are “measurable” (Doran 1981: 36). CEHQ (2012) calls for performance measures (p. 19).

Items to be scored	Conditions for achieving a full score	References
2. Non-structural indicators	<p>There should be at least some process and/or outcome measures reflecting a range of quality dimensions. Examples include patient experience scores, wait times, health outcomes, adoption rates of recommended drugs, treatments or tests, adverse events, measures of waste and differences in indicators between different population groups (e.g., rural vs. urban).</p> <p>Many plans include “structural” indicators that describe augmenting health facilities or human resources, or implementing programs. While these are acceptable, plans that contained only structural indicators received a score of zero for this item.</p>	<p>The WHO NQPS recommends considering a variety of means of conceptualizing indicators, including Donabedian’s structure/process/outcome framework (WHO 2018: 58), but does not specifically mandate a mix of these three.</p> <p>Donabedian (1966) notes that structural indicators are limited in that their relation to processes and outcomes are often not well established. They indicate conditions conducive to care but cannot assert that care is good or bad and, hence, a mix of all three is desirable (Donabedian 1988).</p> <p>CEHQ (2012) also calls for a mix of all three indicator types (p. 21).</p>
3. Reporting of baseline	<p>For all true quality indicators, there should be a reference to a baseline value within the planning document. A baseline allows the reader to determine the magnitude of the improvement being proposed.</p>	<p>Item 4 in the WHO NPQS calls for a “situational analysis,” including “performance data about quality from the health care system” (WHO 2018: 41).</p> <p>CEHQ (2012) says targets should be based on “an accurately measured starting point or baseline” (p. 22).</p>
4. Existence of targets	<p>There should be a clear numeric target for each indicator. A statement such as “reduce smoking rate” is not considered to be a target, while “reduce smoking rate to 5%” is a clear target.</p>	<p>Item 1 in the WHO NPQS calls for “National health goals and priorities” to be set (WHO 2018: 20).</p> <p>The SMART framework says goals should be specific (Doran 1981).</p> <p>CEHQ (2012) calls for targets (pp. 22–23).</p>

Items to be scored	Conditions for achieving a full score	References
5. At least some stretch targets	There should be at least two indicators that represent an ambitious or "stretch" target, defined as: a 40% relative reduction in some undesirable indicator or the degree of improvement judged to be significant compared to the typical level of annual improvement found in public reports or an attempt to raise current performance significantly to some known benchmark (e.g., results of a top-performing organization). For example, an absolute improvement in patient experience or patient behaviours of 5% was considered a stretch, recognizing that historically, such indicators are difficult to advance. The target should be relevant to an indicator of major significance within the population.	The WHO NPQS does not explicitly recommend stretch targets, and the SMART framework emphasizes achievable, rather than ambitious (Collins and Porras 2005: 91-114; Doran 1981: 36; WHO 2018: 21-22). The management literature, however, describes numerous benefits from stretch goals as a means of inspiring the workforce toward a common, focused objective (Collins and Porras 2005) and encouraging novel and creative approaches (Rousseau 1997). Their usefulness depends on staff being given tools, resources and autonomy needed for success (Sherman 1995; Thompson et al. 1997).
6. Clear time frame	There should be a clear time frame for when the target should be achieved (e.g., "by March 2023").	The WHO NPQS says "[Goals] should be clear... and should also be time bound" (WHO 2018: 22). The SMART framework says goals should be "time-bound" (Doran 1981: 36). CEHQ (2012) calls for a specific time frame (pp. 26-28).
7. Existence of progress report	There should be documents produced periodically during the planning period that describe progress made toward targets. Ideally, the progress report should reference the same indicators and targets that were described in the original plan.	The WHO NPQS says "[Goals] should be clear ... with a means to assess progress and achievement" (WHO 2018: 22). CEHQ (2012) calls for regular reporting of progress (pp. 30-32).
Scoring: A jurisdiction received a full point for an item if it fulfilled all or almost all of the criteria noted. A "partial" score of 0.5 points was awarded if it fulfilled about half the criteria. A "minimal" score of 0.25 points was awarded if none of the criteria were fulfilled, except for some small exceptions.		

CEHQ = Collaborative for Excellence in Healthcare Quality.

TABLE A2. Key planning documents used in scoring

	Key documents	Sets priorities	Indicators	Targets	Progress report
Health Canada	2019-20 Departmental Plan	x	x	x	x
British Columbia Ministry of Health	2019/20-2021/22 Service Plan	x	x	x	
	2018/19 Annual Service Plan Report				x
Alberta Health	Business Plan 2019-23	x	x	x	
Alberta Health Services	Annual Report 2019-20				x
	The 2017-2020 Health Plan and Business Plan	x	x	x	
	Year 2 of 3-Year Plan 2018/19 and quarterly updates				x
Saskatchewan Ministry of Health	Plan for 2018-19 Plan for 2019-20	x	x	p	
	Annual Report for 2019-20				(x)
Saskatchewan Health Authority	Strategic Plan 2019-20	x			
	Business Plan 2019-20	x			
	Annual Report 2019-20		x	x	x
Manitoba Health, Seniors and Active Living	No system-wide planning document identified				
	Sector-specific plans: Delivering Excellence: 2016-2021 Manitoba Cancer Plan; Manitoba's Five-Year Falls Prevention Plan; Injury Prevention Plan: Taking Steps to Prevent Injuries in Manitoba; Manitoba's Framework for Alzheimer's Disease and Other Dementias; Rising to the Challenge: A Strategic Plan for the Mental Health and Well-Being of Manitobans	x	p		

	Key documents	Sets priorities	Indicators	Targets	Progress report
Ontario Ministry of Health	Patients First: Action Plan for Health Care (2015)	x			
	Patients First: Action Plan For Health Care – Year-Two Results				(x)
	Nine sector-specific plans: Ontario Cancer Plan 5, 2019–2023; Access to Care Plan, 2019–2023; Ontario Renal Plan 3, 2019–2023; Smoke-Free Ontario: The Next Chapter – 2018 – for a Healthier Ontario; Health Shared Services Ontario, Annual Business Plan FY 2018/19; Strategic Plan 2014–2019, Public Health Ontario; Make No Little Plans: Ontario’s Public Health Sector Strategic Plan, 2013; Mental Health and Addictions: Realizing the Vision, 2017; Ontario Critical Care Plan 2018–2021	x	p	P	
New Brunswick Department of Health	Rebuilding Health Care Together: The Provincial Health Plan 2013–2018	x			
	Health Annual Report 2018–19	x	x		(x)
Nova Scotia Department of Health and Wellness	Business Plan 2019–20	x			
	Accountability Report 2017–18				(x)
	Sector-specific report for tobacco control	x	x		
Nova Scotia Health Authority	Healthier Together: 2016–19 Strategic Plan	x	x		
	Business Plan 2018–19	x			
	Macro Key Performance Indicators, 2017–18 Patient Experience 2017–18 Strategic Plan Measures		x	x	
	Healthier Together 2016–19: Measuring Our Progress		p	p	p

	Key documents	Sets priorities	Indicators	Targets	Progress report
PEI Department of Health and Wellness	Strategic Plan 2019–2022	x			
	Sector-specific plans: Chief Public Health Office Strategic Plan, 2019–2021; PEI Action Plan to Prevent and Mitigate Opioid-Related Overdoses and Deaths; PEI 2016–2026 Mental Health and Addiction Strategy; Promoting Wellness, Preserving Health: A Provincial Action Plan for Seniors, New Seniors, and Caregivers Living on Prince Edward Island; The Building Blocks of Hope: A Suicide Prevention Strategy for PEI	x	(x)		
Health PEI	Strategic Plan 2017–2020	x			
	Business Plan 2018–2019		x	x	
	Annual Report 2018–2019			x	x
Newfoundland Department of Health and Community Services	Strategic Plan 2017–20	x			
	Annual Report 2017–2018				(x)
	Sector-specific reports: A Strategy to Reduce Emergency Department Wait Times in Newfoundland and Labrador 2012; A Strategy to Reduce Hip and Knee Joint Replacement Surgery Wait Times in Newfoundland and Labrador 2012; The Way Forward: Towards Recovery: The Mental Health and Addictions Action Plan for Newfoundland and Labrador; Provincial Cancer Control Advisory Committee – Activity Plan, April 1, 2017–March 31, 2020; Autism Action Plan 2019–2022	x	p		
Yukon Department of Health and Social Services	Health and Social Services Strategic Plan 2014–2019	x	x		
	Performance Measure Framework 2014–2019		x		
NWT Department of Health and Social Services	Caring for Our People: Strategic Plan for the NWT Health and Social Services System 2017–2020	x			
	2018–2019 Annual Report				(x)

	Key documents	Sets priorities	Indicators	Targets	Progress report
Nunavut Department of Health	Business Plan, Government of Nunavut and Territorial Corporations, 2018-2021	x			
	Annual Report 2016-2017				(x)
	Sector-specific plans: Inuusivut Anninaqtuq: Action Plan 2017-2012 for Suicide Prevention; Continuing Care Services Action Plan, 2017/18-2021/22	x			

x = the document contains the item identified in the column;

(x) = the report describes progress on activities completed but not progress toward targets as measured by indicators;

p = the document contains a partial description of the item identified in the column.

NWT = Northwest Territories; PEI = Prince Edward Island.